

PROOFS TO SUBSTANTIATE THAT  
QIR'AAT (QUR'AAN) SHOULD NOT BE  
RECITED BY THE MUQTADEE BEHIND  
THE IMAAM

By

Moulana Ilyas Ghuman

(May Allaah Ta'ala have mercy on him)

First Impression

نَحْمَدُهُ وَنُصَلِّي عَلَى رَسُولِهِ الْكَرِيمِ

In The Name of Allaah, The Most Gracious The Most Merciful

### PROOF NUMBER ONE:-

“When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it (*stop talking*) and remain silent (*let one read and others listen*) so that mercy may be shown to you.” (*Surah A'raaf, Aayat 204*)

### COMMENTARY

Hadrat Muhammad bin Qurazi (May Allaah Ta'ala have mercy on him) states, “Previously when Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) would lead the Salaah then those behind (Muqtadees) would repeat the words after him.

When Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) would recite, بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ then those behind would also recite, بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ until Surah Fatiha was completed (in this manner).

This continued as the practice until Allaah Ta'ala willed. When the following verse of the Qur'aan was revealed, “When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it (*stop talking*) and remain silent (*let one read and others listen*) so that mercy may be shown to you”, then Nabi

(sallallahu alayhi wasallam) would recite the Qur'aan and the Sahabah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with them) would remain silent. (*Tafseer Ibni Abi Haatim Raazi Vol 4 Page 259, Kitaabul Qir'aat Imaam Baihaqi Page 89*)

### PROOF NUMBER TWO:-

Hadhrat Abu Musa Ash'ari (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) narrates that Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) said, "When the Imaam recites the Qur'aan then you (the Muqtadee) should remain silent and when the Imaam recites, *غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الضالين* then say Aameen.

(*Saheeh Abi Uwaanah Vol 1 Page 360; Sunan Ibni Maajah Page 61*)

### PROOF NUMBER THREE:-

Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) narrates that Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) said, "The Imaam has been appointed (specifically) so that he may be followed. When the Imaam recites Takbeer then you too should recite the Takbeer (and) when the Imaam recites the Qur'aan then you should remain silent (and) when the

Imaam recites، غير المغضوب عليهم ولا الصالين then say Aameen. (*Sunan Ibni Maajah Page 61; Sunan Nasa'i Vol 1 Page 146*)

#### PROOF NUMBER FOUR:-

Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) narrates that once, upon Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) completing a 'Jahri Salaah' (wherein the Imaam recites Qir'aat loud) he turned towards us and asked, "Who of you was reciting Qur'aan behind me?" One Sahabi replied that he was (reciting Qur'aan behind). Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) said, "I also say (ask) why is it that the Qur'aan is arguing with me?" After this, the Sahabah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with them) desisted from reciting Qur'aan behind Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) in Salaah." (*Muwatta Imaam Malik Page 69; Muwatta Imaam Muhammad Page 95*)

#### PROOF NUMBER FIVE:-

Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) reports that a person recited Qur'aan behind Nabi (sallallahu alayhi

wasallam) in the Zuhr or Asr Salaah. One person attempted to silence him by means of signals. When he (the former) completed his Salaah then he exclaimed to the one preventing him, "Do you prevent me from reciting Qur'aan behind Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam)? This (discussion) continued between the two until Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) heard of it. (At this) Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) remarked, "One who recites Qur'aan behind the Imaam should know that the Qir'aat of the Imaam is sufficient for him." (*Kitaabul Aathaar of Imaam Abu Haneefah as narrated by Imaam Abu Yusuf* Page 23; *Musnad Abu Haneefah as narrated by Abu Muhammad Al-Haarithi* Page 116)

#### PROOF NUMBER SIX:-

Hadhrat Anas (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) narrates that once after leading the Salaah, Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) turned towards the people and asked, "Do you recite of the Qur'aan even whilst the Imaam does so?" The Sahabah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with them) remained silent. Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) repeated his question three times. The Sahabah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with

them) replied, “We do recite of the Qur'aan behind the Imaam.” Upon (hearing) this, Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) remarked, “Do not recite of the Qur'aan behind the Imaam.” (*Sunan Tahaawi Vol 1 Page 159; Ahkaamul Qur'aan of Imaam Tahawi Vol 1 Page 252*)

#### PROOF NUMBER SEVEN:-

Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) narrates that Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) said, “One who is behind the Imaam (should realise) that the Qir'aat (recitation) of the Imaam is his (the Muqtadee's) Qir'aat i.e. it suffices him.” (*Musnad Abu Haneefah as narrated by Muhammad Al-Haarithi Page 114; Musnad Abu Haneefah as narrated by Abu Nu'aim Page 405*)

#### PROOF NUMBER EIGHT:-

Hadhrat Musa bin Uqba (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) reports that Nabi (sallallahu alayhi wasallam) prevented Hadhrat Abu Bakr, Hadhrat Umar and Hadhrat Uthmaan (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased

with them) from Qir'aat (reciting the Qur'aan) behind the Imaam.

*(Musannaf Abdur Razzaaq Vol 2 Page 91; Umdatul Qaari Vol 4 Page 449)*

### PROOF NUMBER NINE:-

Hadhrat Zaid bin Aslam (May Allaah Ta'ala have mercy on him) states that the following ten Sahabah (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with them) would prevent the Muqtadees from reciting Qur'aan behind the Imaam;

- 1) Hadhrat Abu Bakr (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 2) Hadhrat Umar Faruq (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 3) Hadhrat Uthmaan (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 4) Hadhrat Ali (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 5) Hadhrat Abdur Rahman bin Awf (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 6) Hadhrat Sa'ad bin Abi Waqqaas (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 7) Hadhrat Abdullah bin Mas'ood (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)
- 8) Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)

9) Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him)

10) Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him).

#### PROOF NUMBER TEN:-

When Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) would be asked if the Muqtadee may recite Qir'aat (Qur'aan) behind the Imaam, he would respond that the Qir'aat of the Imaam suffices the Muqtadee. (He would also say that) When you perform Salaah alone (a Munfarid) then you should recite Qur'aan. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar (May Allaah Ta'ala be pleased with him) himself would not recite Qur'aan behind the Imaam. (*Muwatta Imaam Malik Page 69; Muwatta Imaam Muhammad Page 95*)

AND ALLAAH TA'ALA KNOWS BEST

(Translated by Moulana Munir Aadam)